

## Irish comments on FCD ISO/IEC 10646-1/PDAM 15 (Kangxi radicals and CJK radicals supplement) - Reference: SC2 N3213

Closes: 1999-02-05

Date: 1999-01-19

**Q1:** Ireland approves the PDAM registration.

**Q2:** Ireland disapproves the PDAM draft with the technical comments given below. Acceptance of these reasons and appropriate changes in the text will change our vote to approval.

### Technical:

1. With regard to the distinction made between Kanxi radicals and the CJK radicals supplement, we have grave concerns with regard to the duplication of radicals in the UCS. The CJK radicals especially appear to be designed for more than description of characters. *We suggest very strongly that CJK radicals supplement be removed entirely from this PDAM pending further research and justification.*

2. In general, we believe that a thorough review of the character names needs to be undertaken, because of the very great utility which radicals have to learners of languages which use CJK ideographs, since such users may have recourse to the UCS names, and may wish, for example, to find them in dictionaries.

As a test, we undertook a review of the Kanxi radicals by looking them up in a dictionary commonly found in Irish bookstores, the *Concise English-Chinese Chinese-English dictionary (Jīng xuǎn Yīng-Hàn Hàn-Yīng cídiǎn)*, Oxford and Shāng Wù, ISBN 0-19-584048-8. This dictionary contains some 20,000 entries in each section. The first thing we did was to look up the English gloss of the current names. In most cases (68.3%) we were able to verify the names by finding the correct character immediately. When we did not find a suitable character under the English name, we looked for the radical in the radical index, and found there just over half the remaining characters (16.8%), which we then looked up in the Chinese half of the dictionary; most of these yielded characters with a different gloss than has been proposed in the PDAM. The remaining 14.9% of the radicals we were unable to find in the dictionary. (We know that the dictionary consulted is not a large dictionary with many historical characters, and that a larger dictionary could yield a higher percentage of matches.)

Of the 16.8% for which we found different names, not all of them were found under the “raw” radical. We do not consider this problematic; if one looks at the Yi radicals in FPDAM 14, one finds a convention which can be successfully applied to the ideographic radicals. By convention a Yi radical is named either by the Yi syllable to which it corresponds exactly (YI SYLLABLE TU ㄊ = YI RADICAL TU ㄊ), or by the simplest Yi syllable which contains the radical (YI SYLLABLE WO ㄨㄛ > YI RADICAL WO ㄨㄛ; YI SYLLABLE DU ㄉㄨ > YI RADICAL DU ㄉㄨ). A number of the names for the ideographic radicals in this PDAM follow this convention (KANGXI RADICAL ICE < *bīng*, KANGXI RADICAL HEAD < *shǒu*, KANGXI RADICAL TIGER < *hǔ*).

We propose that the same convention be applied to a number of the characters in the PDAM which have been named according to a physical description of their shape (KANGXI RADICALS LINE, DOT, SLASH, LID, CLIFF, etc.), so that their names, instead, reflect the simplest real character which contains them (PLENTIFUL, JUSTICE, NINE, FLEE, FACTORY, etc.). We would like to request the Chinese NB to prepare a paper which documents *all* of the missing radicals, by showing them, if possible, with photocopies from a Chinese-English dictionary with the example chosen for the character’s name as constructed according to the principle described here. Such a document would be essential for resolving the naming issue.

We do not wish to see terms like LINE, DOT, CLIFF, etc., because the user may be confused by an inconsistent naming convention, since one can find RADICAL MAN by looking up “man” ‘*rén*’, but one cannot find RADICAL LINE by looking up “line” ‘*xián, suǒ, shéng*’ in a dictionary.

Hex	Name	Pinyin	Gloss	Change to:
2F00	KANGXI RADICAL ONE	yī	one	
2F01	KANGXI RADICAL LINE	fēng	plentiful	PLENTIFUL
2F02	KANGXI RADICAL DOT	yì	justice	JUSTICE
2F03	KANGXI RADICAL SLASH	jiǔ	nine	NINE
2F04	KANGXI RADICAL SECOND	yǐ	second	
2F05	KANGXI RADICAL HOOK			radical not found
2F06	KANGXI RADICAL TWO	èr	two	
2F07	KANGXI RADICAL LID	wáng	flee	FLEE
2F08	KANGXI RADICAL MAN	rén	man	
2F09	KANGXI RADICAL LEGS	ér	son	SON
2F0A	KANGXI RADICAL ENTER	rù	enter	
2F0B	KANGXI RADICAL EIGHT	bā	eight	
2F0C	KANGXI RADICAL DOWN BOX	gāng	ridge	RIDGE
2F0D	KANGXI RADICAL COVER	rǒng	superfluous	SUPERFLUOUS
2F0E	KANGXI RADICAL ICE	bīng	ice	
2F0F	KANGXI RADICAL TABLE	jī	table	
2F10	KANGXI RADICAL OPEN BOX	xiōng	fierce	FIERCE
2F11	KANGXI RADICAL KNIFE	dāo	knife	
2F12	KANGXI RADICAL POWER	lì	power	
2F13	KANGXI RADICAL WRAP	shào	spoon	SPOON
2F14	KANGXI RADICAL SPOON			radical not found
2F15	KANGXI RADICAL RIGHT OPEN BOX	qū	area	AREA
2F16	KANGXI RADICAL HIDING ENCLOSURE			radical not found
2F17	KANGXI RADICAL TEN	shí	ten	
2F18	KANGXI RADICAL DIVINATION	bǔ	divination	
2F19	KANGXI RADICAL SEAL	wèi	defend	DEFEND
2F1A	KANGXI RADICAL CLIFF	chǎng	factory	FACTORY
2F1B	KANGXI RADICAL PRIVATE	yǔn	permit	PERMIT
2F1C	KANGXI RADICAL AGAIN	yòu	again	
2F1D	KANGXI RADICAL MOUTH	kǒu	mouth	
2F1E	KANGXI RADICAL ENCLOSURE	líng/qiǔ	?/imprison	IMPRISON (?)
2F1F	KANGXI RADICAL EARTH	tǔ	earth	
2F20	KANGXI RADICAL SCHOLAR	shì	scholar	
2F21	KANGXI RADICAL GO	dōng	winter	WINTER
2F22	KANGXI RADICAL GO SLOWLY			radical not found
2F23	KANGXI RADICAL EVENING	xī	evening	
2F24	KANGXI RADICAL BIG	dà	big	
2F25	KANGXI RADICAL WOMAN	nǚ	woman	
2F26	KANGXI RADICAL CHILD	zǐ	child	
2F27	KANGXI RADICAL ROOF	níng	peaceful	PEACEFUL
2F28	KANGXI RADICAL INCH	cùn	three centimetres	THREE CM
2F29	KANGXI RADICAL SMALL	xiǎo	small	
2F2A	KANGXI RADICAL LAME	yóu	particularly	PARTICULARLY
2F2B	KANGXI RADICAL CORPSE	shī	corpse	
2F2C	KANGXI RADICAL SPROUT	chú	?	
2F2D	KANGXI RADICAL MOUNTAIN	shān	mountain	
2F2E	KANGXI RADICAL RIVER	zāi	disaster	DISASTER
2F2F	KANGXI RADICAL WORK	gōng	work	
2F30	KANGXI RADICAL ONESELF	jǐ	oneself	
2F31	KANGXI RADICAL TURBAN	jīn	turban	
2F32	KANGXI RADICAL DRY	gān	dry	
2F33	KANGXI RADICAL THREAD	yāo	?	
2F34	KANGXI RADICAL DOTTED CLIFF	guǎng	broad	BROAD
2F35	KANGXI RADICAL LONGSTRIDE			radical not found
2F36	KANGXI RADICAL TWO HANDS	huì	grass	GRASS
2F37	KANGXI RADICAL SHOOT	yì	?	

2F38	KANGXI RADICAL BOW	gōng	bow	
2F39	KANGXI RADICAL SNOOT	guī	return	RETURN
2F3A	KANGXI RADICAL BRISTLE	xíng	shape	SHAPE
2F3B	KANGXI RADICAL STEP	chì	?	
2F3C	KANGXI RADICAL HEART	xīn	heart	
2F3D	KANGXI RADICAL HALBERD	gē	halberd	
2F3E	KANGXI RADICAL DOOR	hù	door	
2F3F	KANGXI RADICAL HAND	shǒu	hand	
2F40	KANGXI RADICAL BRANCH	zhī	branch	
2F41	KANGXI RADICAL RAP	qiāo	knock	KNOCK
2F42	KANGXI RADICAL SCRIPT	wén	script	
2F43	KANGXI RADICAL DIPPER	dǒu	dipper	
2F44	KANGXI RADICAL AXE	jīn	half kilogram	HALF KILOGRAM
2F45	KANGXI RADICAL SQUARE	fāng	square	
2F46	KANGXI RADICAL NOT			radical not found
2F47	KANGXI RADICAL SUN	rì	sun	
2F48	KANGXI RADICAL SAY	yuē	say	
2F49	KANGXI RADICAL MOON	yuè	moon	
2F4A	KANGXI RADICAL TREE	mù	tree	
2F4B	KANGXI RADICAL LACK	qiàn	owe	OWE
2F4C	KANGXI RADICAL STOP	zhǐ	stop	
2F4D	KANGXI RADICAL DEATH	dǎi	bad	BAD
2F4E	KANGXI RADICAL WEAPON	shū	?	
2F4F	KANGXI RADICAL DO NOT			radical not found
2F50	KANGXI RADICAL COMPARE	bǐ	compare	
2F51	KANGXI RADICAL FUR	máo	fur	
2F52	KANGXI RADICAL CLAN	shì	clan	
2F53	KANGXI RADICAL STEAM	qì	steam	
2F54	KANGXI RADICAL WATER	shuǐ	water	
2F55	KANGXI RADICAL FIRE	huǒ	fire	
2F56	KANGXI RADICAL CLAW	zhǎo	claw	
2F57	KANGXI RADICAL FATHER	fù	father	
2F58	KANGXI RADICAL DOUBLE X			radical not found
2F59	KANGXI RADICAL HALF TREE TRUNK			radical not found
2F5A	KANGXI RADICAL SLICE	piàn	slice	
2F5B	KANGXI RADICAL FANG	yá	fang	
2F5C	KANGXI RADICAL COW	niú	cow	
2F5D	KANGXI RADICAL DOG	zhuàng	strong	STRONG
2F5E	KANGXI RADICAL PROFOUND			radical not found
2F5F	KANGXI RADICAL JADE	yù	jade	
2F60	KANGXI RADICAL MELON	guā	melon	
2F61	KANGXI RADICAL TILE	wǎ	tile	
2F62	KANGXI RADICAL SWEET			radical not found
2F63	KANGXI RADICAL LIFE	shēng	life	
2F64	KANGXI RADICAL USE	yòng	use	
2F65	KANGXI RADICAL FIELD	tián	field	
2F66	KANGXI RADICAL BOLT OF CLOTH	pǐ	?	
2F67	KANGXI RADICAL SICKNESS	dīng	malignant boil	BOIL
2F68	KANGXI RADICAL DOTTED TENT			radical not found
2F69	KANGXI RADICAL WHITE	bái	white	
2F6A	KANGXI RADICAL SKIN	pí	skin	
2F6B	KANGXI RADICAL DISH	mǐn	?	
2F6C	KANGXI RADICAL EYE	mù	eye	
2F6D	KANGXI RADICAL SPEAR	máo	spear	
2F6E	KANGXI RADICAL ARROW	shǐ	arrow	
2F6F	KANGXI RADICAL STONE	shí	stone	

2F70	KANGXI RADICAL SPIRIT	shì	show	SHOW
2F71	KANGXI RADICAL TRACK			radical not found
2F72	KANGXI RADICAL GRAIN	hé	grain	
2F73	KANGXI RADICAL CAVE	xué	cave	
2F74	KANGXI RADICAL STAND	lì	stand	
2F75	KANGXI RADICAL BAMBOO	zhú	bamboo	
2F76	KANGXI RADICAL RICE	mǐ	rice	
2F77	KANGXI RADICAL SILK			radical not found
2F78	KANGXI RADICAL JAR			radical not found
2F79	KANGXI RADICAL NET	wǎng	net	
2F7A	KANGXI RADICAL SHEEP	yáng	sheep	
2F7B	KANGXI RADICAL FEATHER	yǔ	feather	
2F7C	KANGXI RADICAL OLD	lǎo	old	
2F7D	KANGXI RADICAL AND			radical not found
2F7E	KANGXI RADICAL PLOW	lěi	?	(PLOUGH)
2F7F	KANGXI RADICAL EAR	ěr	ear	
2F80	KANGXI RADICAL BRUSH	yù	?	
2F81	KANGXI RADICAL MEAT			radical not found
2F82	KANGXI RADICAL MINISTER	chén	minister	
2F83	KANGXI RADICAL SELF	zì	self	
2F84	KANGXI RADICAL ARRIVE			radical not found
2F85	KANGXI RADICAL MORTAR	jiù	mortar	
2F86	KANGXI RADICAL TONGUE	shé	tongue	
2F87	KANGXI RADICAL OPPOSE			radical not found
2F88	KANGXI RADICAL BOAT	zhōu	boat	
2F89	KANGXI RADICAL STOPPING			radical not found
2F8A	KANGXI RADICAL COLOR	sè	colour	COLOUR
2F8B	KANGXI RADICAL GRASS			radical not found
2F8C	KANGXI RADICAL TIGER	hǔ	tiger	
2F8D	KANGXI RADICAL INSECT	chóng	insect	
2F8E	KANGXI RADICAL BLOOD	xuè	blood	
2F8F	KANGXI RADICAL WALK ENCLOSURE			radical not found
2F90	KANGXI RADICAL CLOTHES	yī	clothes	
2F91	KANGXI RADICAL WEST	xī	west	
2F92	KANGXI RADICAL SEE	jiàn	see	
2F93	KANGXI RADICAL HORN	jiǎo	horn	
2F94	KANGXI RADICAL SPEECH	yán	word	WORD
2F95	KANGXI RADICAL VALLEY	gǔ	valley	
2F96	KANGXI RADICAL BEAN	dòu	bean	
2F97	KANGXI RADICAL PIG	shǐ	?	
2F98	KANGXI RADICAL BADGER	zhì	?	
2F99	KANGXI RADICAL SHELL	bèi	shellfish	SHELLFISH
2F9A	KANGXI RADICAL RED	chì	red	
2F9B	KANGXI RADICAL RUN	zǒu	walk	WALK
2F9C	KANGXI RADICAL FOOT	zú	foot	
2F9D	KANGXI RADICAL BODY	shē	body	
2F9E	KANGXI RADICAL CART	mǎ	cart	
2F9F	KANGXI RADICAL BITTER	xīn	bitter	
2FA0	KANGXI RADICAL MORNING	chén	morning	
2FA1	KANGXI RADICAL WALK			radical not found
2FA2	KANGXI RADICAL CITY			radical not found
2FA3	KANGXI RADICAL BIRD SIGN	yǒu	?	
2FA4	KANGXI RADICAL DISTINGUISH	xī	know	KNOW
2FA5	KANGXI RADICAL VILLAGE	lǐ	neighbourhood	NEIGHBOURHOOD
2FA6	KANGXI RADICAL GOLD	jīn	gold	
2FA7	KANGXI RADICAL LONG	cháng	long	
2FA8	KANGXI RADICAL GATE	mén	gate	

2FA9	KANGXI RADICAL MOUND			radical not found
2FAA	KANGXI RADICAL SLAVE	lì	slave	
2FAB	KANGXI RADICAL SHORT TAILED BIRD			radical not found
2FAC	KANGXI RADICAL RAIN	yǔ	rain	
2FAD	KANGXI RADICAL BLUE	qīng	blue	
2FAE	KANGXI RADICAL WRONG	fēi	wrong	
2FAF	KANGXI RADICAL FACE	miàn	face	
2FB0	KANGXI RADICAL LEATHER	gé	leather	
2FB1	KANGXI RADICAL TANNED LEATHER	wéi	reed	REED
2FB2	KANGXI RADICAL LEEK	jiǔ	leek	
2FB3	KANGXI RADICAL SOUND	yīn	sound	
2FB4	KANGXI RADICAL LEAF	yè	page	PAGE
2FB5	KANGXI RADICAL WIND	fēng	wind	
2FB6	KANGXI RADICAL FLY	fēi	fly	
2FB7	KANGXI RADICAL EAT	shí	eat	
2FB8	KANGXI RADICAL HEAD	shǒu	head	
2FB9	KANGXI RADICAL FRAGRANT	xiāng	fragrant	
2FBA	KANGXI RADICAL HORSE	mǎ	horse	
2FBB	KANGXI RADICAL BONE	gǔ	bone	
2FBC	KANGXI RADICAL TALL	gāo	tall	
2FBD	KANGXI RADICAL HAIR	fà	hair	
2FBE	KANGXI RADICAL FIGHT	dòu	fight	
2FBF	KANGXI RADICAL SACRIFICIAL WINE			radical not found
2FC0	KANGXI RADICAL CAULDRON			radical not found
2FC1	KANGXI RADICAL GHOST	guǐ	ghost	
2FC2	KANGXI RADICAL FISH	yú	fish	
2FC3	KANGXI RADICAL BIRD	niǎo	bird	
2FC4	KANGXI RADICAL SALT	lǚ	bittern	BITTERN
2FC5	KANGXI RADICAL DEER	lù	deer	
2FC6	KANGXI RADICAL WHEAT	mài	wheat	
2FC7	KANGXI RADICAL HEMP	má	hemp	
2FC8	KANGXI RADICAL YELLOW	huáng	yellow	
2FC9	KANGXI RADICAL MILLET	shǔ	millet	
2FCA	KANGXI RADICAL BLACK	hēi	black	
2FCB	KANGXI RADICAL EMBROIDERY			radical not found
2FCC	KANGXI RADICAL FROG	miǎn	frog	
2FCD	KANGXI RADICAL TRIPOD			radical not found
2FCE	KANGXI RADICAL DRUM	gǔ	drum	
2FCF	KANGXI RADICAL RAT	shǔ	rat	
2FD0	KANGXI RADICAL NOSE	bí	nose	
2FD1	KANGXI RADICAL EVEN			radical not found
2FD2	KANGXI RADICAL TOOTH	chǐ	tooth	
2FD3	KANGXI RADICAL DRAGON	lóng	dragon	
2FD4	KANGXI RADICAL TURTLE	guī	turtle	
2FD5	KANGXI RADICAL FLUTE			radical not found