

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-08-04

Document: ISO/IEC 10646:2014 PDAM2

| 1 | 2 | (3) | 4 | 5 | (6) | (7) |
|-----------------|--|---|---|---|--|---|
| MB ¹ | Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1) | Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1) | Type of com- ment ² | Comment (justification for change) by the MB | Proposed change by the MB | Secretariat observations on each comment submitted |
| GB1 | 24.3 | | ed | Subclause title incorrectly refers to CJK ideographs. | Change "Source reference presentation for CJK Unified Ideographs" to "Source reference presentation for Tangut Ideographs". | |
| GB2 | 25.8 | | ed | Spurious CJK character at the end of the paragraph. | Remove "□" at end of paragraph. | |
| GB3 | 31.2 (32.2) | | ed | The subclause references the wrong clauses for CJK and Tangut code chart formats. | Change "See Clause 24 and 25" to "See Clause 23 and 24". | |
| GB4 | 31 | | ed | The list of code points added to existing blocks has some mistakes. | Change "08B6-08B6" to "08B6-08B7". Remove "A8FD FE2E-FE2F" (Amd. 1 additions). | |
| GB5 | 31 | Mongolian | te | As 181A is named "MONGOLIAN ORNAMENTED BIRGA", the double and triple birga signs should also be named as "ORNAMENTED BIRGA" for consistency. Note, it is conceivable that unornamented double and triple birga symbols could exist, and they would then be named "MONGOLIAN DOUBLE BIRGA" and "MONGOLIAN TRIPLE BIRGA". | Change the name of 181C from "MONGOLIAN DOUBLE BIRGA" to "MONGOLIAN DOUBLE ORNAMENTED BIRGA". Change the name of 181D from "MONGOLIAN TRIPLE BIRGA" to "MONGOLIAN TRIPLE ORNAMENTED BIRGA". | |
| GB6 | 31 | CJK Unified Ideographs | te | The characters at 9FCD through 9FE9 have not been reviewed by WG2, and were not added to the repertoire of Amendment 2 by WG2 resolution, but were added at the discretion of the project editor. We approve of the inclusion of 9FCD through 9FD7 in this amendment, but have concerns about the appropriateness of encoding the eighteen characters at 9FD8 through 9FE9. Evidence of the usage of 9FD8 through 9FE9 has been provided in WG2 N4583, but conclusive evidence that these are actually individual, discrete characters has not been presented. Each of these characters comprises two CJK ideographs placed side-by-side in a single character space to indicate the pronunciation of a particular syllable of a biblical name, with the right hand ideograph indicating the syllable's initial sound, and the left hand ideograph indicating the syllable's final sound. This method of phonetic notation (known as <i>fanqie</i> in Chinese) | Remove 9FD8 through 9FE9 from Amendment 2. | |

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-08-04

Document: ISO/IEC 10646:2014 PDAM2

| 1 | 2 | (3) | 4 | 5 | (6) | (7) |
|-----------------|--|---|---|---|---------------------------|---|
| MB ¹ | Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1) | Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1) | Type of com- ment ² | Comment (justification for change) by the MB | Proposed change by the MB | Secretariat observations on each comment submitted |
| | | | | <p>is very common for representing Sanskrit, Tangut, Tibetan, Mongolian, Manchu and other languages in pre-modern Chinese linguistic texts, where commonly the two <i>fanqie</i> characters are squeezed together into the space normally used to contain a single ideograph.</p> <p>In the case of 9FD8 through 9FE9, it is quite possible that these are also pairs of <i>fanqie</i> characters squeezed into a single character space rather than individual characters, in which case displaying the pairs of <i>fanqie</i> characters in a single character space is a presentation issue, which can easily be solved by word processors or in html/css. In the absence of any documentation about these characters by their creator, it is difficult to be sure whether they were intended to be two characters placed together as a phonetic notation, or whether they really were intended to be discrete characters. However, the discussion on pp. 3-4 of N4583 implies that in modern horizontal left-to-right layout the positions of the two ideographs within the "character" may be swapped (so that the <i>fanqie</i> pair is read left-to-right), which is an indication that each "character" is indeed a pair of characters rather than a single, discrete character.</p> <p>We further note that in the online version of the Russian New Testament translation that uses the characters proposed in N4583 (http://jesus.tw/Orthodox/New_Testament), the text is laid out horizontally left-to-right. Here the characters in question are represented by superscripting the right hand ideograph of the <i>fanqie</i> pair to the right of the full-sized left hand ideograph, which does not accord with the established methods of indicating an unencoded Han ideograph on the internet. One could either interpret this to mean that the editors of the online edition had no way to represent the 9FD8 through 9FE9 and so used this layout as a hack; or one could interpret this to mean that the editors of the online edition recognised that these</p> | | |

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-08-04

Document: ISO/IEC 10646:2014 PDAM2

| 1 | 2 | (3) | 4 | 5 | (6) | (7) |
|-----------------|--|---|---|--|--|---|
| MB ¹ | Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1) | Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1) | Type of com- ment ² | Comment (justification for change) by the MB | Proposed change by the MB | Secretariat observations on each comment submitted |
| | | | | <p>were two separate characters used together as an indication of pronunciation, and it did not really matter whether they were squeezed together in a single character space or whether they were superscripted, just as long as the presentation format indicates that they are to be read together.</p> <p>We are concerned that if the eighteen characters at 9FD8 through 9FE9 are encoded, it will set a precedent for encoding an open-ended set of hundreds of <i>fanqie</i> character pairs used for phonetic notation of other languages. We believe that the wider issue of encoding such phonetic character pairs should be addressed before accepting 9FD8 through 9FE9 for encoding.</p> | | |
| GB7 | 31 | Zanabazar Square | te | The name for 11A29 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER SMALL A is not appropriate, as this is not a small letter. The character should be named "ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER -A" for consistency with the corresponding characters in the Tibetan and Marchen scripts (U+0F60 TIBETAN LETTER -A, U+11C88 MARCHEN LETTER -A). The name of the corresponding character in the Phags-pa script (U+A856 PHAGS-PA LETTER SMALL A) is infelicitous, and should not be taken as a model. | Change the name for 11A29 from "ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER SMALL A" to "ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER -A". | |
| GB8 | 31 | Zanabazar Square | ed | 11A29 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER SMALL A should not be aliased as "Tibetan 'a-chung". | For 11A29 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER SMALL A, remove the alias "Tibetan 'a-chung". | |
| GB9 | 31 | Zanabazar Square | ed | It would be helpful to provide comprehensive annotations on the usage of the consonant characters for representing Mongolian, Sanskrit and Tibetan, based on information provided in N4541 §4.7.3. | <p>For 11A0B ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER KA, replace the note "Mongolian ga, gamma" with "Mongolian ga, ḡa; Sanskrit ka; Tibetan ka".</p> <p>For 11A0C ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER KHA, replace the note "Mongolian ka, qa, xa" with "Mongolian ka, qa, xa; Sanskrit kha, Tibetan kha".</p> <p>For 11A0D ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER GA, add the note "Sanskrit ga; Tibetan ga".</p> <p>For 11A0E ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER GHA,</p> | |

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

| 1 | 2 | (3) | 4 | 5 | (6) | (7) |
|-----------------|--|---|---|--|--|---|
| MB ¹ | Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1) | Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1) | Type of com- ment ² | Comment (justification for change) by the MB | Proposed change by the MB | Secretariat observations on each comment submitted |
| | | | | | <p>add the note "Sanskrit gha; Tibetan gha".</p> <p>For 11A0F ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER NGA, add the note "Sanskrit ṅa; Tibetan ṅa".</p> <p>For 11A10 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER CA, add the note "Tibetan ca".</p> <p>For 11A11 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER CHA, add the note "Tibetan cha".</p> <p>For 11A12 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER JA, add the note "Tibetan ja".</p> <p>For 11A13 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER NYA, add the note "Sanskrit ṅa; Tibetan ṅa".</p> <p>For 11A14 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER TTA, add the note "Sanskrit ṭa; Tibetan ṭa".</p> <p>For 11A15 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER TTHA, add the note "Sanskrit ṭha; Tibetan ṭha".</p> <p>For 11A16 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER DDA, add the note "Sanskrit ḍa; Tibetan ḍa".</p> <p>For 11A17 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER DDHA, add the note "Sanskrit ḍha; Tibetan ḍha".</p> <p>For 11A18 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER NNA, add the note "Sanskrit ṇa; Tibetan ṇa".</p> <p>For 11A19 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER TA, replace the note "Mongolian da" with "Mongolian da; Sanskrit ta; Tibetan ta".</p> <p>For 11A1A ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER THA, replace the note "Mongolian ta" with "Mongolian ta; Sanskrit tha; Tibetan tha".</p> <p>For 11A1B ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER DA, add the note "Sanskrit da; Tibetan da".</p> | |

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

| 1 | 2 | (3) | 4 | 5 | (6) | (7) |
|-----------------|---|--|------------------------------|--|---|--|
| MB ¹ | Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1) | Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1) | Type of comment ² | Comment (justification for change) by the MB | Proposed change by the MB | Secretariat observations on each comment submitted |
| | | | | | <p>For 11A1C ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER DHA, add the note "Sanskrit dha; Tibetan dha".</p> <p>For 11A1D ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER NA, add the note "Mongolian na; Sanskrit na; Tibetan na".</p> <p>For 11A1E ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER PA, replace the note "Mongolian ba" with "Mongolian ba; Sanskrit pa; Tibetan pa".</p> <p>For 11A1F ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER PHA, replace the note "Mongolian pa" with "Mongolian pa; Sanskrit pha; Tibetan pha".</p> <p>For 11A20 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER BA, replace the note "Mongolian va" with "Mongolian va; Sanskrit ba; Tibetan ba".</p> <p>For 11A21 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER BHA, add the note "Sanskrit bha; Tibetan bha".</p> <p>For 11A22 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER MA, add the note "Mongolian ma; Sanskrit ma; Tibetan ma".</p> <p>For 11A23 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER TSA, replace the note "Mongolian ja, Sanskrit ca" with "Mongolian ja; Sanskrit ca; Tibetan tsa".</p> <p>For 11A24 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER TSHA, replace the note "Mongolian ca, Sanskrit cha" with "Mongolian ca; Sanskrit cha; Tibetan tsha".</p> <p>For 11A25 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER DZA, replace the note "Sanskrit ja" with "Sanskrit ja; Tibetan dza".</p> <p>For 11A26 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER DZHA, replace the note "Sanskrit jha" with</p> | |

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

| 1 | 2 | (3) | 4 | 5 | (6) | (7) |
|-----------------|---|--|------------------------------|--|--|--|
| MB ¹ | Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1) | Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1) | Type of comment ² | Comment (justification for change) by the MB | Proposed change by the MB | Secretariat observations on each comment submitted |
| | | | | | <p>"Sanskrit jha; Tibetan dzha".</p> <p>For 11A27 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER ZHA, add the note "Tibetan źa".</p> <p>For 11A28 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER ZA, add the note "Tibetan z".</p> <p>For 11A29 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER SMALL A, add the note "Tibetan 'a".</p> <p>For 11A2A ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER YA, add the note "Mongolian ya; Sanskrit ya; Tibetan ya".</p> <p>For 11A2B ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER RA, add the note "Mongolian ra; Sanskrit ra; Tibetan ra".</p> <p>For 11A2C ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER LA, add the note "Mongolian la; Sanskrit la; Tibetan la".</p> <p>For 11A2D ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER VA, add the note "Sanskrit va; Tibetan wa".</p> <p>For 11A2E ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER SHA, add the note "Mongolian řa; Sanskrit řa; Tibetan řa".</p> <p>For 11A2F ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER SSA, add the note "Sanskrit řa; Tibetan řa".</p> <p>For 11A30 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER SA, add the note "Mongolian sa; Sanskrit sa; Tibetan řa".</p> <p>For 11A31 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER HA, add the note "Mongolian ha; Sanskrit ha; Tibetan řa".</p> <p>For 11A32 ZANABAZAR SQUARE LETTER</p> | |

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-08-04

Document: ISO/IEC 10646:2014 PDAM2

| 1 | 2 | (3) | 4 | 5 | (6) | (7) |
|-----------------|--|---|---|--|--|---|
| MB ¹ | Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1) | Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1) | Type of com- ment ² | Comment (justification for change) by the MB | Proposed change by the MB | Secretariat observations on each comment submitted |
| | | | | | KSSA, add the note "Sanskrit क़ा; Tibetan ཀྲེ།". | |
| GB1 0 | 31 | Tangut | te | The font used for the Tangut code chart is derived from the font used to print Li Fanwen's 2008 <i>Tangut-Chinese Dictionary</i> (L2008), but in a few cases the glyph in L2008 and its associated font do not correctly represent the glyph form of the corresponding character as found in primary Tangut sources. A review of the Tangut glyph forms in Amd. 2 was carried out by experts from China, Russia and the UK, the results of which are reported in WG2 N4588. The review has identified twenty-seven characters with incorrect glyphs, which should be corrected. In most cases the glyph changes result in a change of stroke count and/or radical, and so the characters also need to be reordered, as detailed in the report. | Make glyph changes and reorder characters, as detailed in WG2 N4588. Update TangutSrc.txt with modified stroke counts and radical numbers as appropriate. | |
| GB1 1 | 31 | Nushu | te | East Asian character repetition marks, such as U+3005 IDEOGRAPHIC ITERATION MARK, U+309D HIRAGANA ITERATION MARK, U+30FD KATAKANA ITERATION MARK, U+A015 YI SYLLABLE ITERATION MARK, and U+16FE0 TANGUT ITERATION MARK all use the term "iteration mark". For consistency, 1B100 should also use the term "iteration mark" rather than "repetition mark". | Change the name of 1B100 from "NUSHU REPETITION MARK" to "NUSHU ITERATION MARK". | |
| GB1 2 | 31 | Nushu | te | If a block has a mixture of fixed names and algorithmically-derived names, it can unnecessarily complicate processing of character names by software processes. Therefore it would be best to remove the Nushu iteration mark (1B100) out of the Nushu block. | Move 1B100 to the new Ideographic Symbols and Punctuation block, at 16FE1. Reorder 1B101 through 1B28C to 1B100 through 1B28B. | |

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.